



Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals

Case No.: MICT-12-29-R

Date: 22 June 2017

Original: English

THE PRESIDENT OF THE MECHANISM

Before: Judge Theodor Meron, President

Registrar: Mr. Olufemi Elias

Decision of: 22 June 2017

PROSECUTOR

v.

AUGUSTIN NGIRABATWARE

PUBLIC

**DECISION ON RENEWED MOTION TO MODIFY
CONDITIONS OF DETENTION**

The Office of the Prosecutor

Mr. Serge Brammertz
Mr. Richard Karegyesa
Ms. Sunkarie Ballah-Conteh

Counsel for Mr. Augustin Ngirabatware

Mr. Peter Robinson

**Received by the Registry
Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals**

22/06/2017 11:21

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be a stylized 'P' followed by a long horizontal stroke.

I, THEODOR MERON, President of the International Residual Mechanism for Criminal Tribunals (“Mechanism”);

NOTING the “Judgement and Sentence” issued by Trial Chamber II of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda on 20 December 2012 in the case of *The Prosecutor v. Augustin Ngirabatware*, Case No. ICTR-99-54-T;

NOTING the “Judgement” issued by the Appeals Chamber of the Mechanism (“Appeals Chamber”) on 18 December 2014 in the case of *Augustin Ngirabatware v. The Prosecutor*, Case No. MICT-12-29-A;

NOTING the “Motion for Review of Judgement” filed confidentially on 8 July 2016 by Augustin Ngirabatware (“Request for Review” and “Ngirabatware”, respectively);

RECALLING that, on or around 21 September 2016, Judge Aydin Sefa Akay, a member of the bench of the Appeals Chamber in this case, was detained in the Republic of Turkey in relation to allegations connected with the events of July 2016 directed against the constitutional order of Turkey, and that Judge Akay has remained in detention since that time;¹

NOTING the “Decision on Motion to Report Government of Turkey to United Nations Security Council and for Modification of Conditions of Detention” rendered on 22 March 2017 (“22 March Decision”), wherein I, *inter alia*, denied Ngirabatware’s request for modification of his conditions of detention and invited him to make a renewed application should there be no material change in the circumstances that were giving rise to the ongoing delay in his case by 9 June 2017;²

NOTING that Ngirabatware remains in the custody of the Mechanism at the United Nations Detention Facility in Arusha, pending transfer to a State where his sentence will be served;

BEING SEISED OF the “Renewed Motion to Modify Conditions of Detention” filed by Ngirabatware on 26 May 2017 (“Renewed Motion”), wherein Ngirabatware contends, *inter alia*, that there has been no material change in the circumstances that are giving rise to the ongoing delay in his case, namely Judge Akay’s continued detention by the Government of Turkey,³ and requests that his conditions of detention be modified to mitigate the prejudice caused by the undue delay in his case;⁴

NOTING in particular Ngirabatware’s request that I order the modification of his conditions of detention until such time as Judge Akay “rejoins the Appeals Chamber bench hearing [Ngirabatware’s] case”;⁵

¹ See Order to the Government of the Republic of Turkey for the Release of Judge Aydin Sefa Akay, 31 January 2017, paras. 3-4; Oral Hearing, T. 17 January 2017, pp. 1-2; Order for Oral Hearing, 21 December 2016, p. 1.

² 22 March Decision, p. 4.

³ Renewed Motion, para. 2.

⁴ Renewed Motion, paras. 1, 8. See also Renewed Motion, para. 9.

⁵ Renewed Motion, para. 1. See also Renewed Motion, paras. 2, 6-10.

NOTING the “Prosecution Response to Ngirabatware’s Renewed Motion to Modify Conditions of Detention” filed by the Office of the Prosecutor of the Mechanism on 5 June 2017;

NOTING the “Reply Brief: Renewed Motion to Modify Conditions of Detention” filed by Ngirabatware on 9 June 2017 (“Reply”);

NOTING that a Turkish criminal court of first instance entered a conviction against Judge Akay on 14 June 2017 and that Judge Akay has been provisionally released pending appeal;⁶

NOTING the public and redacted version of the “Decision on Ngirabatware’s Motion for Review” filed on 19 June 2017 (“Decision on Motion for Review”), wherein the Appeals Chamber, *inter alia*, granted the Request for Review and ordered the parties to submit in writing a list of evidence and witnesses, if any, each party proposes to introduce at an eventual hearing;⁷

CONSIDERING that Ngirabatware requests that his conditions of detention be modified until such time as Judge Akay resumes his duties as a member of the bench of the Appeals Chamber in this case;⁸


CONSIDERING that, as demonstrated by the issuance of the Decision on Motion for Review by the Appeals Chamber, Judge Akay has resumed his duties as a member of the bench of the Appeals Chamber in this case;

FOR THE FOREGOING REASONS,

HEREBY DISMISS the Renewed Motion as moot.

Done in English and French, the English version being authoritative.

Done this 22nd day of June 2017,
At The Hague,
The Netherlands.


Judge Theodor Meron
President

[Seal of the Mechanism]



⁶ See “Statement of the Mechanism on Conviction of Judge Aydin Sefa Akay by Turkish Criminal Court of First Instance”, dated 15 June 2017, available at <http://www.unmict.org/en/news/statement-mechanism-conviction-judge-aydin-sefa-akay-turkish-criminal-court-first-instance>.

⁷ Decision on Motion for Review, p. 3. See also Decision on Motion for Review, p. 2.

⁸ See Renewed Motion, para. 1. See also Reply, para. 10.



**TRANSMISSION SHEET FOR FILING OF DOCUMENTS WITH THE
MECHANISM FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS/
FICHE DE TRANSMISSION POUR LE DÉPÔT DE DOCUMENTS DEVANT LE
MÉCANISME POUR LES TRIBUNAUX PÉNAUX INTERNATIONAUX**

I - FILING INFORMATION / INFORMATIONS GÉNÉRALES

To/ À :	MICT Registry/ <i>Greffe du MPTI</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Arusha/ <i>Arusha</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> The Hague/ <i>La Haye</i>
From/ De :	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chambers/ <i>Chambre</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Defence/ <i>Défense</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Prosecution/ <i>Bureau du Procureur</i>
Case Name/ Affaire :	Prosecutor v. Augustin Ngirabatware	Case Number/ Affaire n° :	MICT-12-29-R
Date Created/ Daté du :	22 June 2017	Date transmitted/ Transmis le :	22 June 2017
Original Language / Langue de l'original :	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> English/ <i>Anglais</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> French/ <i>Français</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda <input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S <input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :
Title of Document/ Titre du document :	Decision on renewed motion to modify conditions of detention		
Classification Level/ Catégories de classification :	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Unclassified/ <i>Non classifié</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte Defence excluded/ <i>Défense exclue</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte Prosecution excluded/ <i>Bureau du Procureur exclu</i>
	<input type="checkbox"/> Confidential/ <i>Confidentiel</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte R86(H) applicant excluded/ <i>Art. 86 H) requérant exclu</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte Amicus Curiae excluded/ <i>Amicus curiae exclu</i>
	<input type="checkbox"/> Strictly Confidential/ <i>Strictement confidentiel</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte other exclusion/ <i>autre(s) partie(s) exclue(s)</i> (specify/préciser) :	
Document type/ Type de document :	<input type="checkbox"/> Motion/ <i>Requête</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Submission from parties/ <i>Écritures déposées par des parties</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Indictment/ <i>Acte d'accusation</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Decision/ <i>Décision</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Submission from non-parties/ <i>Écritures déposées par des tiers</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Warrant/ <i>Mandat</i>
	<input type="checkbox"/> Order/ <i>Ordonnance</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Book of Authorities/ <i>Recueil de sources</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Appeal/ <i>Acte d'appel</i>
	<input type="checkbox"/> Judgement/ <i>Jugement/Arrêt</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Affidavit/ <i>Déclaration sous serment</i>	

II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE/ ÉTAT DE LA TRADUCTION AU JOUR DU DÉPÔT

<input type="checkbox"/> Translation not required/ <i>La traduction n'est pas requise</i>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and requests the Registry to translate/ <i>La partie déposante ne soumet que l'original et sollicite que le Greffe prenne en charge la traduction : (Word version of the document is attached/ La version Word est jointe)</i>					
<input type="checkbox"/> English/ <i>Anglais</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> French/ <i>Français</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S	<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :	
<input type="checkbox"/> Filing Party hereby submits both the original and the translated version for filing, as follows/ <i>La partie déposante soumet l'original et la version traduite aux fins de dépôt, comme suit :</i>					
Original/ Original en	<input type="checkbox"/> English/ <i>Anglais</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> French/ <i>Français</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S	<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :
Translation/ Traduction en	<input type="checkbox"/> English/ <i>Anglais</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> French/ <i>Français</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S	<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :
<input type="checkbox"/> Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s)/ <i>La partie déposante soumettra la (les) version(s) traduite(s) sous peu, dans la (les) langue(s) suivante(s) :</i>					
<input type="checkbox"/> English/ <i>Anglais</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> French/ <i>Français</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S	<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :	

Send completed transmission sheet to/ *Veillez soumettre cette fiche dûment remplie à :*
JudicialFilingsArusha@un.org OR/OU JudicialFilingsHague@un.org

Rev: April 2014/Rév. : Avril 2014